

REPORT

A NEW GENERATION OF TERRORISM: AN ANALYSIS OF FETÖ

A NEW GENERATION OF TERRORISM AN ANALYSIS OF FETÖ



POLİS AKADEMİSİ YAYINLARI

A NEW GENERATION OF TERRORISM AN ANALYSIS OF FETÖ

FETÖ WORKSHOP REPORT

TURKISH NATIONAL POLICE ACADEMY

A NEW GENERATION OF TERRORISM: AN ANALYSIS OF FETÖ

.....
COPYRIGHT © Turkish National Police Academy - 2017.

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, distributed, or transmitted in any form or by any means, including photocopying, recording, or other electronic or mechanical methods, without the prior written permission of the publisher. Contents of this publication do not reflect Police Academy's official stance. Information and opinions in the analysis belong to the participants of the workshop.

.....
Turkish National Police Academy Press: 34

Report No: 14

November 2017

ISBN: 978-605-4619-63-4

First edition: November 2017

TURKISH NATIONAL POLICE ACADEMY

Necatibey Caddesi No: 108 Anıttepe 06400 Çankaya/ANKARA-Türkiye

Phone: +90 312 462 90 58

CONTENTS

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY	5
FETÖ'S SOCIO-PSYCHOLOGICAL ANALYSIS	7
FETÖ'S RELIGIOUS UNDERSTANDING	14
SECURITY BUREAUCRACY AND FETÖ'S ORGANIZATION.....	18
FETÖ'S ORGANIZATION IN EDUCATION.....	22
FETÖ'S FINANCIAL STRUCTURE	25
“EXAMINATIONS” AS A MEANS FOR FETÖ TO INFILTRATE STATE INSTITUTIONS.....	28
THE JUDICIAL STRUGGLE AGAINST FETÖ	31
THE POLITICAL AND ADMINISTRATIVE STRUGGLE AGAINST FETÖ	35
GENERAL ASSESSMENT AND SUGGESTIONS	38
PARTICIPANTS.....	42

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

The Fethullahist Terrorist Organization (FETÖ), led by Fetullah Gülen, is one of the direst security, socio-economic, socio-political and socio-psychological issues currently facing Turkey. In order to combat FETÖ efficiently, the organization, activities and methods of this terrorist group should first be well comprehended.

In line with the objective of shedding more light on this terrorist group's activities, the Turkish National Police Academy organized a workshop including the participation of relevant stakeholders such as academics, politicians, administrative actors and legal practitioners who are participating in the fight against this menace, the resulting discussions, opinions and suggestions have been recorded in this report.

Firstly, the radicalization process of FETÖ members was discussed from a scientific point of view. It is known that the organization establishes a psychological dominance over its members. As a result of this psychological control exerted, the FETÖ is able to radicalize its members, enabling them to take actions without the hesitation that a normal person with moral values would have

By employing reinforcement and punishment methods along with imposing its own "holy" values and references, the FETÖ permeates into all aspects of their members' lives. Thus, it is critical to analyze the scope and means of this control and how to eradicate or transform the mindset of those who support the organization. The FETÖ's religious understanding was also discussed during the workshop, touching on how the organization repurposes religious terminology and values according to its own interest. Looking at its 40-year history, it can be seen that FETÖ most often employs religious values while seeking to organize and legitimize itself; the organization attempts to portray itself as a religious congregation. However, in reality FETÖ is more of an esoteric modern cult.

Indeed, it is known that there are and always have been many organizations operating with a similar socio-psychological organization and similar actions to the FETÖ. Establishing his

influence through prophecies and other unusual methods used to attain information, the FETÖ ringleader consolidates his power using Sufi terminology and values. The organization has attached itself to numerous people in both Turkey and many other countries around the world.

FETÖ's infiltration into the security bureaucracy, education and economic sectors were also discussed during the workshop. Instead of having a popular base, the organization has attempted to consolidate power by way of its members holding important positions within the country's bureaucracy. It is well known that the organization has infiltrated the military, police and judiciary system in order to hijack the political system.

As a result of its infiltration into the security bureaucracy, FETÖ has transformed into an armed terrorist organization. Moreover, the organization has successfully managed to place its own members into all levels of bureaucracy. By stealing examination questions and displacing existing bureaucrats via illegal and illegitimate methods, the organization has established a parallel state within the state.

FETÖ's educational activities have been prominent in providing human resources and establishing financial power. Through educational activities, the organization has trained its members, placed students into targeted institutions and generated a revenue of billions via their schools, preparatory schools and educational materials. Considering that FETÖ first started to target the prime minister after it was announced that all preparatory schools were to be closed down demonstrates the importance of the educational sector for the terrorist organization.

Analogous to all other terrorist organizations, FETÖ has a strong financial structure. However, the structure itself is different than many other terrorist organizations. FETÖ's financial mechanism relies on himmet (favours) collected from the salaries of its members, revenues generated from education, trade or faux-charity institutions directly connected to the organization, and public resources transferred by FETÖ members who have infiltrated state bodies.

Political, administrative and legal battles against the FETÖ were also discussed during the workshop. The objective criteria of the legal dimension indicate that the state has established a meticulous legal framework against the terrorist organization. In this respect, it could be understood that the members of the judiciary have clear standards in determining whether a person is affiliated with FETÖ or have participated in any terrorist activities.

18 assessments and suggestions provided by the participants are provided at the end of this report. Participants expressed their opinions and suggestions according to their field of study. The suggestions assert what should be done in the fields of politics, administration and judiciary in order to fight more efficiently against the FETÖ.

■ FETÖ'S SOCIO-PSYCHOLOGICAL ANALYSIS

Looking at FETÖ's organization and actions, it can be seen that FETÖ relies on members who do whatever they are commanded to do without any questions. Indeed, because of this feature, the organization was able to maintain its activities covertly, while engaging in many illegal and illegitimate actions throughout the years. In order to fully understand FETÖ's organizational structure and actions its radicalization processes and the mindset and psychological status of its members should be meticulously analyzed.

Psychological and behavioral dominance over an individual's behaviors and emotions allows total control over a person's mental processes. FETÖ's most clear form of dominance over its members is what is called psychological control. This method functions similarly to how parents establish control over their children. This is done in two ways. The first is "behavioral control" which is achieved through rewarding or punishing a behavior. The second method is "psychological control" in which a person is rewarded or punished according to what they feel.

Since the organization prefers to focus on emotions, it employs psychological control mechanisms on children especially aged 12-13 when they stay in the organization's dormitories. FETÖ permeates into all aspects of its militants by way of rewarding and punishment methods along with imposing "holy" values and references. This dominance over emotions allows the FETÖ to interfere with all aspects of members' lives.

The most significant instance of this situation can be seen in the interchanges between the FETÖ pilots who bombed the Presidential Palace on July 15; they have always referred to the Presidential Palace as the “Illegal Palace”. The reason for the use of this expression is to keep FETÖ members’ feelings of hatred and anger alive. In this respect, socio-psychological assessments aiming to decode how the organization dominates its members are important in fighting FETÖ and other similar organizations.

The socio-psychological analyses of FETÖ members provided in this report rely on the confessions made by former members of the organization during interviews prior to the July 15, leaked statements of putschists and speeches of FETÖ’s ringleader Fethullah Gülen. FETÖ is distinct from various modern cults active in the world today. FETÖ distinguishes itself in

As it is the case with all terrorist organizations, FETÖ radicalizes its own members. It can be observed that the militants believe they completely belong to the organization.

two aspects. Firstly, the organization relies on the “stay-behind” principle, which means that its militants are covert and constitute sleeper cells. Secondly, the organization has a large popular base. Even though support for the organization which aims to divide the nation is waning, famous figures

such as Hakan Şükür and Enes Kanter who even changed his surname to show support for the organization, are still backing the FETÖ. Moreover, especially after July 15, FETÖ members who were once able to stay covert are now identifying themselves as victims of statutory decrees in social media, still trying to play the victim.

The most important issue is to determine how to eradicate or to transform the popular support for the organization.

In order to achieve this, one should first understand FETÖ members’ mental transformations. As it is the case with all terrorist organizations, FETÖ radicalizes its own members. It can be observed that the militants believe they completely belong to the organization. Having a rigid hierarchy, FETÖ creates and consolidates this feeling of belonging through the “us-them” discourse. The “us” part is filled with qualities such as piety, purity and divinity, making the militants believe that they are morally superior to all. The passion to be superior in all fields, ranging from circulation figures in FETÖ newspapers to schools opened by the organization in various countries, is due to this emotional disorder.

It could also be asserted that this “us-them” dichotomy, has prominent functions in establishing the esoteric facet of the organization. FETÖ imposes its norms by providing for its members, creating a high-level threat perception that the members will suffer financially and

morally if they discontinue to be a part of “us”. This high-level threat perception is crucial; FETÖ continues to propagate cautiousness to its members while creating the perception that the legalization of women attending universities and working in public institutions with their hijabs is a trap to uncover and unravel the organization. The FETÖ also continued to encourage their female members to forsake hijabs, implying that the organization would be exposed by them.

When analyzing the FETÖ ringleader Gülen’s speech, it can be seen that he almost never uses the pronoun “I”, but always emphasizes “us”. This has great socio-psychological implications; the organization demands its members to forsake their individual values and accept group’s norms, dissolving their individuality. Another prominent instance of the emphasis on “us” is made by the Pope. When a cardinal is elected the pope, he always uses the pronoun “us” instead of “I”, as he is believed to represent a group as a whole. For the FETÖ, this kind of representation is realized by Gülen. Deeming himself as the “imam of the universe” he highlights his religious leadership and representation.

The FETÖ ringleader Gülen has never directly expressed what he wants; he always employs indirect communication. This communication style creates a mystical impression, while disallowing “us” to become “I” again. Through this mystical position and the frequent usage of Islamic terms like “Mahdi” and “Messiah”, Gülen was able to lead FETÖ members to believe that he is the Mahdi. Indeed, while he was focused on interfaith dialogue, the 470th volume of the periodical Aksiyon, dated December 8th 2003, had a picture of Jesus on the cover, which conveyed the message that the world was awaiting him; this was done in order to consolidate the perception of himself as the Messiah.

FETÖ even gives new names to its members, replacing the birth names given by their families. For this reason, FETÖ members do not know each other by their real names. This also causes these militants to forsake the set of values and morality taught by their families in favor of the one provided by the organization.

Another aspect of using the pronoun “us” is that it allows the organization to sever the ties of its members with their previous social circles and even their family. According to theories on radicalization, those who have strong bonds with family, relatives, friends or certain groups are less likely to join radical organizations. Indeed, FETÖ has limited its members’ transactions with those who are not members of the organization, thus weakening their old ties, in order to radicalize them and impose a new set of values.

FETÖ militants not providing any information about the organization to their families and prioritizing the organization over their families indicate that these militants accept FETÖ as their new family. Indeed, FETÖ even gives new names to its members, replacing the birth names given by their families. For this reason, FETÖ members do not know each other by their real names. This also causes these militants to forsake the set of values and morality taught by their families in favor of the one provided by the organization. In this respect, while collecting *himmet* for the organization, stealing questions and answers of the exams for selecting public personnel, causing the dismissal of colleagues through forged documents, misconduct and treason are popularly deemed as unacceptable, these militants are able to do all of the aforementioned without any regrets or hesitation because of their newly embedded faux identity and morality.

Those who are referred to as “elder brothers” or “elder sisters” are crucial in creating this new identity. Similar to other terrorist organizations, FETÖ makes these elder brothers and sisters responsible for the new recruits. By these means, FETÖ imprisons its members within certain symbols, increasing their emotional bond with the organization and, thus, establishing a new family. As it is well-known, after one’s parents, elder brothers and sisters are the closest to a person. Indeed, referring to these experienced members as elder brothers and sisters creates the illusion that they are family. Through this tactic, the organization aims to replace its members’ parents.

The organization especially awaits the time when children are transitioning from primary to secondary education. This is the time when students have identity crises due to adolescence and are stressed because they are studying for the high school entrance examination. Successful students who are going through an identity crisis during this time are lured to the organization with certain symbols. While the organization tries to win over successful and disciplined students, it keeps those who question and criticize away from the organization. FETÖ severs its ties with prospective members who start to question the organization. However FETÖ never announces that these inquisitive students should leave the organization, creating the perception that it is all voluntary. In addition, when certain prospective members that are deemed useful want to quit FETÖ, the whole organization mobilizes in order to win these prospective members back. They may resort to practices such as gifting these prospective members electronics or even threatening these people and their families. Before July 15th, the organization attempted to reconnect with those who had severed their ties with the organization through repeated phone calls, trying to regain legitimacy and bolster its base.

As it was stated before, besides being very effective in employing symbols, FETÖ also employs dreams and the holy words of Islam in order to guide its members. Certain instances include the following:

- FETÖ ringleader Gülen visiting militants' houses with all the prophets
- An additional prayer rug being placed for Gülen during prayer
- Claiming that certain FETÖ houses have Gülen's slippers Elder brothers and sisters secretly pour rose water into slippers in the house and claim that Gülen is visiting the house when the scent spreads
 - Giving items seen in dreams to the person who had the dream
 - While determining the schools for their younger members, using sentences like "you have blue eyes, you would suit the navy"

These symbols are crucial for FETÖ's communication of members and organization. The usage of symbols allows members to internalize messages better, rendering these messages clandestine.

Indeed, FETÖ has indicated that it would be attempting a coup in the short term through the covers of September 2015 and May 2016 issues of *Sızıntı* periodical and *Zaman* daily's advertisement that was in circulation by the end of 2015. On the September 2015 issue's cover, there was an aircraft, helicopters, ships and a quartet about the expected beloved. It was obvious that this was not normal for a periodical that is about culture and the arts. The quartet, on the other hand, was actually about FETÖ's ringleader Gülen himself.

On the May 2016 cover, there is a hand of a man wearing a military uniform opening a door and a quartet about salvation and anticipation; both of these are symbolic messages foreshadowing the coup attempt. Meanwhile, in the advertisement of the *Zaman* daily, a siren is heard which is followed by a helicopter flying over the city. Then, after an abrupt interruption, there is a baby who is laughing. The advertisement clearly symbolizes a new birth. It is understood that FETÖ had embedded a symbol and psychological trigger to its members who in the near future would fire on unarmed citizens without any question during the attempted coup.

Another interesting symbol about the coup is in a supplementary book that is published and distributed by the Ministry of National Education (MEB) in September and October of every year. There is a reading which is titled "July 15 Kite Festival" which was published at time when FETÖ was still dominant in MEB. This indicates that FETÖ prepared the July 15 coup attempt according to a well-designed plan. Moreover, it is possible to assert that the coup attempt was conveyed to students as a subliminal message.

FETÖ also emphasizes the divinity of certain objects while using symbols. It can be seen that the organization attempted to convey messages using elements with historical and religious values. Some of the examples are the following:

- Hakan Şükür trying to take Selim I's kaftan to Fethullah Gülen in 2005. If the kaftan had been stolen, it would never be returned. In the event that the planned coup attempt was successful, the FETÖ ringleader would have possibly worn the kaftan while returning to Turkey. Considering that Selim I was the sultan who conquered the Hijaz region, which is deemed holy by the people, and the sultan who brought the caliphate to the Ottomans, it can be presumed what kind of a perception was attempted to be created.

- FETÖ naming its schools in Turkey after prominent Turkish and Islamic figures, such as Saladin, Suleyman Shah, Malik Shah, Rumi, Orhangazi, Mehmed II, Necip Fazıl Kısakürek, Nurettin Topçu and Turgut Özal, creates the perception that its organization is glorious.

- After the July 15 coup attempt, at the Yamanlar school in İzmir, a hidden room which contained a plaster sculpture of a hand was discovered. The investigations revealed that this hand was presumed to be Gülen's hand and that those who were entering the room kissed it to show respect. Thus, this ritual is can be interpreted as concrete evidence of the FETÖ ringleader's moral and material dominance.

FETÖ's frequent usage of symbols to train its members is indeed an instance of radicaliza-

FETÖ's frequent usage of symbols to train its members is indeed an instance of radicalization. However, the structure of this organization includes elements that existing theories on radicalization fail to address.

tion. However, the structure of this organization includes elements that existing theories on radicalization fail to address. It is observed that individuals, especially those having psychological, sociological and criminological issues, radicalize over a certain amount of time. These radicalized

individuals then lean towards the most active and organized extremist movements. In the case of FETÖ, however, this is the opposite; people are radicalized after joining the organization, not before. Individuals who have no issues with themselves and their social environments are transformed into radicals that are compatible with the secrecy of the organization once the indoctrination process has taken place.

FETÖ members' radicalization processes is different from general radicalization tendencies in terms of time. While theories on radicalization assert that radicalization is generally realized over the span of 3 to 12 months, FETÖ members' radicalization processes take decades. It is understood that FETÖ has been radicalizing its members for three or four decades and mobilized these members after the December 17-25 coup attempts. Throughout these decades, the members of the organization have lived a double life. Militants were persuaded that the world

outside of FETÖ is enveloped in chaos and suffering and started living in an imaginary world created by the organization.

For this reason, it is believed that the normalization of individuals who were trained and radicalized within this organization will be a prolonged and challenging effort.

Indeed, it is asserted that the members who did not forsake the organization after the February 7, December 17-25 incidents and Gülen's curse videos will continue to be FETÖ members even after the July 15 coup attempt. In this respect, it should not be forgotten that these militants will not act like normal human beings and that they will retain their adopted norms and realities.

"I have burned all bridges. I talk with no one. Where will I return?" This sentence, spoken by a member of the organization is important. It should be considered that they can actually rebuild these bridges in different forms. FETÖ attempts to show "post-truth" realities as the real reality by playing the victim. For this reason, standing against the false discourses of the organization as a society is important. We should never forget that we are at war with FETÖ which will surely continue for a couple of generations and that although we have won several battles, the war is still at stake.

■ FETÖ'S RELIGIOUS UNDERSTANDING

Looking at the statements made on FETÖ and the information provided through confessions especially after July 15, it can be seen that they are inconsequential and concern tabloids rather than providing crucial information. Moreover, there is a deliberate tendency to reduce this organization to a terrorist organization, without touching on its religious dimension. This organization consists of many components and infrastructures. FETÖ's 40 years history indicates that the organization has mobilized religious values the most in the process of organizing and legitimizing itself.

Indeed, those confessing saying that they have already “lost this world” but do not want to lose “the world beyond” when talking about the organization indicates how effectively the FETÖ has instilled religious fear and put pressure onto its members. It can be seen that these people who believe they will go to hell if they speak against the organization were radicalized as a result of an esoteric indoctrination and that FETÖ has transformed into a modern cult. For this reason, FETÖ is more of an esoteric modern cult rather than a religious congregation.

It is known that there are many examples of modern cults and organizations which have similar socio-psychological structures to that of the FETÖ. These groups are referred to as prophesy groups in social psychology. Present especially in the US, these radical groups which obey their leaders without any questions shows extreme behavior to the extent of mass suicide.

All of these groups have a radicalization process which starts with a prophesy about the future, either religious or secular. When the anticipated prophecies are not realized, one would normally expect the members to forsake the group, believing that they were deceived. However, it is observed that these people do not leave the group even though the prophecies do not come true. Since these people have fully devoted themselves to the group and the leader, they continue to believe in the group and await future prophecies. From December 17-25 onwards, the FETÖ ringleader arranging cursing sessions and prophesying their success indicates that the FETÖ shares many similarities to these modern cults. In this respect, it can be asserted that FETÖ is more of a modern cult rather than a religious congregation.

Modern cults have started to appear in the US and Europe from the 1970s onward. While there are some which derive their prophecies from Christianity and Eastern religions, there are other examples of these modern cults which derive their mythology from new social movements. These groups are able to lure people who feel they lack spirituality as a result of Abrahamic religions' waning sway over society by claiming that they can satisfy these metaphysical needs. Modern cults are usually gathered around a leader which is called a guru, whom all members obey. All members are devoted to the group and accept the group norms without questioning them. These members who have forsaken their individuality for the group make efforts to recruit new members.

In short, considering the organization's 40-year-long activities, the FETÖ acts like a modern esoteric cult rather than being a religious congregation.

The most important element which facilitates the leader's and group's authority along with influence is the unusual methods employed to attain information. Modern cults have an unusual and peculiar process of obtaining information. If the cult claims that it is derived from an Abrahamic religion, the authority of this religion's prophet may have transferred it to the leader. These leaders tend to claim that the decision he/she is taking is not his/her own, but has been relayed from a prophet or God. Therefore, all qualities and authorities a prophet has are transferred to the leader of a modern cult.

Because of the organization's esoteric structuring, taqiyya (deception) becomes the first nature of its members. While there are sincere relations within the group, the members have minimal social interactions with the society they belong to. It can be observed that the trust relations between members supersedes their relations with their own families. Another feature of these groups is that they have a strong sense of self-importance, believing that the world revolves around them.

In short, considering the organization's 40-year-long activities, the FETÖ acts like a modern esoteric cult rather than being a religious congregation.

Gülen initially tried to impress and influence people by seemingly being a follower of Said Nursi. Indeed, for a long time FETÖ had identified itself as a branch of the Nursi movement. After Said Nursi's death, his movement was divided into two branches in the 1960s: Yazıcılar (Writers) and Okuyucular (Readers). A member of the Readers, Gülen started to establish his own group (Gülenists) in the 1970s. During this era, he read and instructed his followers to read Said Nursi's works; Gülen has recited Nursi's autobiographical stories as if they were his own. Gülen's aim in doing this was to consolidate his position as the unquestionable leader. Through these means, Gülen has achieved a certain level of legitimacy among Nursi's followers, allowing him to gain a follower base. For this reason, Gülen's main religious references were derived from Said Nursi and Nursi's Epistles until the end of 1990s. This can be clearly observed in Gülen's book *Fasıldan Fasıla (Chapter by Chapter)* whose third edition was published in 1996.

After the FETÖ leader successfully established his religious leadership in his group and spread his influence into state institutions along with society, he started to diverge from Nursi's movement. Therefore, he has since separated himself and his organization from this movement after establishing his authority in the 2000s.

Even though Gülen does not have any connection with Sufism, he has abused Sufi terminology and values for his own interests. Showing himself as the head of a congregation, Gülen has abused the importance of murshid (spiritual guide) in Sufism along with utilizing the guide-follower relations and Sufi values like obtaining knowledge through dreams in order to consolidate his own authority. Indeed, Gülen was attributed with many qualities that were different from the heads of any religious congregations.

Claiming that he constantly sees God and the Prophet Muhammad in his dreams, Gülen has attempted to consolidate his authority and provide legitimacy to his orders by asserting that they were relayed to him in dreams.

Currently, Gülen is attributed with qualities and features that are attributed to the gurus of modern cults. In fact, Gülen has started to give the impression that he is at the level of prophets, similar to other modern cults. Deeming himself as "the imam of the universe" implies that Gülen sees

himself as equal to a prophet; indeed, according to Islam, Prophet Muhammad is the "sultan of the universe". Thus, by claiming he is the imam of the universe, Gülen implies that he is the sultan of the universe as well.

It is known that the process of attaining esoteric information played an important role in the creation of this modern cult, consolidating a leader's position and how the organization functions. As it was stated before, FETÖ utilizes symbols masterfully; however, the organization also employs dreams and Islamic terminology frequently to guide its followers. Indeed, fabricated stories like the FETÖ ringleader Gülen visiting houses together with Prophet Muhammad and gifting items seen in dreams to the person who had the dream has strengthened the relations between the organization and its members. Claiming that he constantly sees God and the Prophet Muhammad in his dreams, Gülen has attempted to consolidate his authority and provide legitimacy to his orders by asserting that they were relayed to him in dreams.

Considering these dreams which were extracted by FETÖ members, it can be seen that Gülen's religious position is sometimes deemed equal to the Prophet Muhammad, sometimes even surpassing him. Orders that are allegedly relayed to Gülen in his dreams encapsulate all aspects of life. Sometimes the dreams are about newspaper subscriptions, other times they are about criticism towards the government's policies. After these dreams, members are instructed on what they should do.

In short, the FETÖ members see Gülen as a Messiah/Mahdi (with the mission to unite Abrahamic religions). This situation caused a "radicalization based on faux-messianism". Gathering around the "Last Savior", militants have closed themselves to the outside world and have gone through a radicalization process which has "normalized" mass murder.

Through his authority, Gülen has ordered this so-called religious organization to commit actions and crimes that are against the basic tenets of Islam. As a result of the leader allowing certain actions to be carried out, FETÖ members believe that these actions were being taken for the sake of religion, even though in reality, they were irrelevant. Indeed, the organization ordered its members to forsake praying, fasting and abstinence in order not to be exposed. This has caused FETÖ members to adopt deception as first nature. Moreover, religiously unacceptable actions like collecting himmet by deceiving people, stealing examination questions, blackmailing people, betraying the country they live in and killing innocent people have all been legitimized through Gülen's approval.

■ SECURITY BUREAUCRACY AND FETÖ'S ORGANIZATION

In order to gain a deeper understanding of FETÖ's emergence in Turkey, one must first analyze the "bureaucratic tutelage" of the 1950s along with the "Gladio" movements. The presence of a bureaucracy autonomous from politics and society has been the most prominent obstruction to the development of Turkish democracy. By creating a limited socio-economic and intellectual base, a small bureaucratic clique has held onto power for many years. Actually, this clique has seized power over civilian politics and established a tutelage system that has been consolidated with coups. FETÖ elements have also attempted to realize their goals through the present structure and attempted to hijack the state.

Statements from military officers who did not participate in the July 15 coup attempt, show that these individuals resisted the coup attempt when they "realized it was not being realized according to the chain of command", which suggests that they still have contempt towards the civilian administration. In addition, these statements also imply that they would have participated in the coup if it had been orchestrated according to the chain of command.

FETÖ militants have utilized the exclusivity provided by this clique to infiltrate bureaucracy, especially security bureaucracy, from the 1970s onwards, eventually capturing certain

bureaucratic structures. This organization was similar to “Gladio” which was in touch with foreign intelligence services. These FETÖ members, similar to bureaucrats of the tutelage system, believe that they are themselves the state. Moreover, in respect to the Gladio movement, Turkey facing synchronized attacks since July 15 indicates that the country is facing the real (“international”) tutors for the first time.

In terms of bureaucracy’s political power, military bureaucracy in Turkey could be considered as the admiral ship. Military interventions that occurred several times in recent history are an indicator of this situation. Having a conservative social base, the process in Turkey up until the 1960 coup had shown that the Gladio movement should forsake “laicist Kemalist” military methods and adopt a new approach. After transitioning into a democracy after 1950, most of the Turkish voters were conservative and “radical laicist elites” were not very compatible with society. In order to maintain the tutelage over politics and society, conservative elites that were trained by “Gladio” type structures and that could appeal to the general population were needed. In fact, a consensus was achieved. Fethullah Gülen was among the people arrested during the 1971 memorandum. After this incident, over the course of the 1970s the core of an organization that would have a four decade long radicalization was created.

FETÖ has prioritized infiltrating security bureaucracy. From the late 1970s onwards, FETÖ started to organize within the military, police and intelligence services. To supervise their militants within these institutions, FETÖ established a special unit and named it “Imam of Confidential Services”. The 1980 coup paved the way for FETÖ elements to organize in military high schools and academies, police colleges and in the Police academy. As the suspects of the July 15 failed coup suggest, entrance examinations to these schools were rigged after the 1980s. Military and police officers who had directly undergone the tutelage of the “Imam of Confidential Services” became the most fervent militants of FETÖ. Radicalized under this “imam”, these police officers and military officers that graduated in the 1980s and 1990s participated in the December 17-25 and July 15 coup attempts.

Looking at the organization’s structure and action, it can be seen that Turkey has been manipulated by FETÖ since the late 1970s. In each

coup, FETÖ was allowed to organize itself within bureaucracy, especially security bureaucracy. Indeed, the organization became more powerful as a result of the martial law imposed during

The organization became more powerful as a result of the martial law imposed during the 1980s. Moreover, all other religious groups were suppressed during the February 28 post-modern coup attempt, leaving FETÖ as the only viable option for the conservative members of society.

the 1980s. Moreover, all other religious groups were suppressed during the February 28 post-modern coup attempt, leaving FETÖ as the only viable option for the conservative members of society. FETÖ militants have eliminated many of civil servants through false reports. Meanwhile, all individuals who were not affiliated with the organization were dismissed from departments with operational power. The 2007 e-memorandum incident was a milestone for the organization; FETÖ increased its influence in the military, police department and National Intelligence Organization (MİT). The opportunity to face the tutelage during the Ergenekon and Balyoz trials processes in 2008 was missed because of FETÖ's manipulations. After Erdoğan's "one minute" incidence at Davos, people affiliated with the organization began to criticize Erdoğan and his government. Especially after 2010 Supreme Board of Judges and Prosecutors elections when FETÖ made an open move and the state reacted to it.

Over the course of the last seven years, FETÖ has attempted to depose Recep Tayyip Erdoğan, whom they see as the most significant obstruction to their own interests several times. In 2011, the records of the Oslo negotiations were leaked by an account named "one minute". After this incident FETÖ started to attack the state and government more fiercely. The organization unexpectedly faltered after the 2012 MİT crisis and the 2013 decision to close down all preparatory schools (FETÖ was a major force in this sector). While political will was planning to cleanse the security bureaucracy from FETÖ in May 2013, the "Gezi Incidents" erupted. On top of all these incidents, FETÖ attempted a coup between December 17-25 to maintain its power.

After all these incidents, FETÖ's covert members within state institutions sabotaged and misguided the state's fight against the organization. In other words, FETÖ was having a mock

With the regulations implemented after December 17-25, FETÖ's hold on the Police Department was weakened, while their future infiltrations through the Police Academy were averted. The most important effect of this change was observed during the July 15 coup attempt as the police force stood together with the elected government and the national will.

fight with itself. The state did try to infiltrate this corrupt structure. Those who were really fighting against FETÖ were falsely reported as members of the organization, going through investigations. The security bureaucracy was forced to fight against FETÖ in a system that was shaped by the organization itself.

After the December 17-25 coup attempts, it was decided to implement a series of democratic reforms in the Police Department and Police Academy. While numerous FETÖ affiliated police officers were dismissed

from the department, significant changes were made to the Law on Higher Education for Police with Law No.6638. As a result of this change, contrary to popular belief, the Police Academy was not closed down, but was consolidated with democratic transformations. Prominent reforms were implemented in deputy police chief training. Moreover, the Police College, providing a 4-year secondary education, and the Faculty of Security Sciences, providing 4-year higher education under the Police Academy, were completely overhauled. Therefore, the FETÖ's hold on the Police Department was weakened, while their future infiltrations through the Police Academy were averted. The most important effect of this change was observed during the July 15 coup attempt as the police force stood together with the elected government and the national will.

In addition, the July 15 coup attempt revealed that the FETÖ does not have any bounds in using security bureaucracy for its treacherous plans. The dimensions of the fight against FETÖ have changed after the aforementioned coup attempt. It should be expressed that until the July 15 coup attempt, the state was only responding to FETÖ's actions, as it lacked a consistent plan in order to fight against the terrorist organization. However, since July 15, the state has been employing a more proactive strategy against FETÖ.

On the other hand, the FETÖ has since organized or participated in certain terrorist attacks to destabilize the country. Chronologically assessing these attacks indicates that Gladio is carrying out a covert operation.

- August 18 2016, bombing of the Elazığ Police Headquarters
- August 20 2016, bombing of a street wedding in Gaziantep
- December 10 2016, bomb attack at the police station in Beşiktaş, Istanbul
- December 17 2016, bomb attack targeting soldiers in Kayseri
- December 19 2016, assassination of Russian Ambassador to Ankara
- January 1 2017, armed attack at Reina
- January 5 2017, armed attack at the Courthouse in İzmir

It is not possible to claim that these attacks which were committed in synchronization by various terrorist organizations requiring prominent financial support were only incidental; these attacks require a mastermind to coordinate them. Meanwhile, it is also known that the FETÖ attempted an economic coup in October 2016. FETÖ continues to misguide security bureaucracy and other public institutions via statutory decrees, aiming to destabilize the state and society. FETÖ is a multidimensional issue which affects social relations, religion, psychology, finance, judiciary and education along with the security bureaucracy. The Turkish state is facing a grave threat to its survival. To overcome this issue, a comprehensive approach should be adopted and this terrorist organization should be fought in every aspect of life.

FETÖ'S ORGANIZATION IN EDUCATION

Even though various dates are suggested for when it was first recognized as an illegal organization, FETÖ was initially referred to as “hizmet” (service) or cemaat (congregation) in a positive way in politics, bureaucracy and the business world until the preparatory school crisis in 2013. Especially bureaucrats who had the authority to make decisions in the field of education were constantly instructed to meet with the “Hizmet Movement”. Meanwhile, it is wrong to claim that FETÖ is a newly emerging organization. Developed according to a plan, the organization is intertwined with the education system and this connection

FETÖ has three reasons for focusing on education. Firstly, developing powerful human capital; secondly, establishing a certain level of legitimacy in Turkey and abroad; thirdly, acquiring significant financial power.

has existed for decades.

From the 1980s onwards, planning 20-30 years ahead, the organization has focused on education with the pressure and/or support of political will, bureaucracy and international powers. FETÖ has three reasons for focusing on education. Firstly, it will allow the organization to recruit new members along with

creating human resources that would lobby for the organization abroad. Secondly, the organization sought to establish legitimacy in Turkey and abroad with the carefully carved facade of being an education movement. Thirdly, FETÖ has become a significant financial power throughout their educational activities.

FETÖ's first step in education was to train teachers. During the 1980s and 1990s, students who were believed to be successful were directed to teacher training high schools and into the faculties of education in universities. Moreover, many FETÖ members were directed to studying in Psychological Counseling and Guidance departments. Therefore, the organization gained teachers that could have close relations with students and lure them into becoming prospective members. In addition, these teachers were able to acquire private information about students and their families. Indeed, many of the current "imams", "chiefs" and "directors" of FETÖ are teachers by occupation.

FETÖ aims to create a human resource through the schools it has opened. The organization has educated successful students with bright futures and the children of high-level bureaucrats and politicians at their own schools free of charge. In this respect, FETÖ has raised loyal human capital by supervising the education of these children from primary to higher education. Therefore, the organization was able to create a member base that would do whatever they are instructed to.

The organization also established its legitimacy through the schools it has opened in Turkey and abroad. Seemingly aiming to train qualified people for the country, the organization's real intent was to gain governmental and public approval. Indeed, they have attempted to consolidate this image by opening up private schools, preparatory schools and "foundation universities" all across Turkey. Meanwhile, FETÖ has also transformed into an international power by opening up "Turkish schools" in various countries around the world. By educating the children of prominent figures at their schools in these countries, FETÖ has established contact with high-level authorities in these countries; meanwhile ensuring that these children, who might one day have prominent positions in their country's governments, will be sympathetic towards the organization. Some countries have disregarded Turkey's calls about FETÖ after July 15 because of these schools. Considering that FETÖ had opened schools in certain countries during the 1990s while Turkey only opened embassies in those very same country in the early 2010s, this is not surprising.

Moreover, the organization also attempted to build a reputation through these schools in Turkey as well. FETÖ aimed to establish another layer of legitimacy by claiming that these schools are spreading the Turkish language and culture to the world. Especially the annual "Turkish Olympics" have consolidated this effect.

Education as a sector also brought unplanned benefits to FETÖ; the private schools and preparatory schools they opened allowed them to generate a significant income, financing their covert operations. Moreover, the organization accumulated tremendous financial capital by getting affluent families to finance their schools and collecting “himmel” from people. They have also created an effective mechanism to launder money. Considering that the organization possessed TRY 8 billion out of the total TRY16 billion in revenue generated by the preparatory schools, it is evident why the organization resisted the closure of the preparatory schools.

Another important revenue-generating activity for the FETÖ was textbooks. MEB distributes free textbooks to all 18 million students in Turkey. The cost of these textbooks is around TRY 300 million. FETÖ generated a significant revenue from “supplementary textbooks”. TRY 850 million in revenue was generated from the sale of labeled textbooks in 2013. This revenue indicates that the organization generated a revenue triple the cost of the distributed free textbooks. Besides labeled textbooks, singular sheets of text which are allowed by the Ministry of Culture to be sold without labels generate a significant revenue for FETÖ.

■ FETÖ'S FINANCIAL STRUCTURE

FETÖ is usually assessed as an alleged religious congregation; however, analyzing its past four decades, it is clear that what we are dealing with is a terrorist organization that is full-fledged and ready to act. All terrorist organizations require a strong financial structure to cover the expenses of their activities, black propaganda and militants. Similar to other terrorist organizations, FETÖ has sought financial power to realize its goals and has actually acquired significant financial power over the years.

Seeming like a legitimate organization, FETÖ was able to establish its own trade network. According to the classical understanding of economics, trade occurs when supply and demand intersect. Creation of supply and demand occurs in two different modes. In the first mode, a supply is created and subsequently a demand is sought for the supply created. This is a challenging model. The second mode is determining a demand and creating a supply to satisfy this demand. The latter is relatively easy and yields more successful results.

In this regards, FETÖ copies the strategies and methods of most significant international companies. This method is to create a supply for an existing demand. Elasticity of supply is rather high. As the demand changes, so does the supply. It is believed that this is the reason why the organization was able to grow to such an extent.

While questioning the notion of supply and demand in respect to the organization, one should consider what members expected from this structure. It is a known fact that those who are affiliated with FETÖ see the organization as a civil society movement. These people believe that FETÖ is an organization that fights against poverty and illiteracy. On the other hand,

FETÖ is like a cooperation. From a business perspective this structure is a means to survive economically, conduct business and compete.

Simultaneously, this dimension of trade is also the soft belly of FETÖ. Those who have joined the organization for psychological reasons are at the core of FETÖ. It is hard to sever these people's ties with the organization, as they believe forsaking it will mean eternal punishment in hell. However, those who view FETÖ as an NGO or a trade association are able to sever their ties with the organization rather easily.

In this respect, there are two groups of people left: those who have devoted their lives to the

Those who have joined the organization for psychological reasons are at the core of FETÖ. It is hard to sever these people's ties with the organization.

organization (believing that they are guaranteed to go to heaven for their loyalty) and those who are co-conspirators of FETÖ. These people run the risk of being exposed if they leave the organization. These two groups of people

still continue to work with FETÖ.

Great responsibility falls on the Presidency of Religious Affairs in the fight against those who joined the organization as a result of religious motives; this situation is caused by a lack of religious knowledge.

The second group that was mentioned above, on the other hand, is concentrated in bureaucratic institutions which handle financial resources. So-called examinations were held while recruiting people for these positions; however, referring to the regulations implemented by themselves, the organization has removed these examinations.

FETÖ's financial structure relies on the transfer of resources from FETÖ-affiliated companies along with public resources funneled into the organization's units. Especially after 2005, many companies have focused on informatics. Similarly, most companies have transferred resources into informatics. Looking at companies working on informatics, it can be seen that almost all of them have affiliations with FETÖ. This also indicates a resource transfer to FETÖ. Since all documents and information are stored digitally, they were acquired by the organization and were used for tax audits.

The organization mostly relies on public resources rather than a popular base. For this reason, FETÖ has captured all financial mechanisms that previously allotted public resources. TÜBİTAK, KOSGEB, National Agency, SODES and KÖYDES are among these institutions and public services. On the other hand, "himmets" which are collected from the people either willingly or unwillingly also constitute a part of FETÖ's financial resources.

In order to eradicate FETÖ's influence, preventing the organization from accessing financial resources is crucial. Even though efforts are mostly being channeled into cleansing the security bureaucracy from the organization which remains important the fight in the field of finance should not be neglected. As long as the organization has financial resources, efforts to fight it will be in vain.

While low-level financial figures of the FETÖ are being apprehended, the superstructure continues to exist. As bureaucracy is

handling this fight with conventional methods, it is hard to gather evidence from FETÖ-affiliated companies. For instance, nothing was found in the investigation of Koza İpek that was conducted by MASAK and the Ministry of Finance. Moreover, with the tax am-

In order to diminish FETÖ's influence, preventing the organization from accessing financial resources is crucial. As long as the organization has financial resources, efforts to fight it will be in vain.

nesty after July 15, records of FETÖ-affiliated companies from the past 5 years were buried up. The tax amnesty was implemented as a form of "tax peace" after the coup attempt and all FETÖ companies became free of taxes before investigations were made. Currently, it is impossible to carry out tax audits of these companies. Therefore, financially punishing the organization is not viable. In order to judicially punish FETÖ, the trial process has to begin. Despite everything, MASAK reports reveal that the FETÖ-affiliated companies have evaded taxes, financed the organization and engaged in money laundering. For this reason, specialization in bureaucracy, security forces and judiciary should be emphasized. It is known that previous instances of sending false information and documents to the courts have only weakened the fight against FETÖ.

Looking at FETÖ's financial structure, it can be seen that the organization focuses on education. With a reform implemented in 2013, graduates of various faculties were enabled to become tax inspectors. This reform is still in force. As donations generate a significant revenue for the organization, a regulation should be implemented to address this issue. Donations are deducted from taxes and thus cause a great financial loss for the state. Considering that FETÖ has a revenue on par with Turkey's annual exports, all changes including the tax regulations should be implemented. Moreover, a council that is to handle financial, trade and legal issues should be formed.

“EXAMINATIONS” AS A MEANS FOR FETÖ TO INFILTRATE STATE INSTITUTIONS

For years, FETÖ gained immense power by such practices as seizing institutions allotting public resources (TÜBİTAK, KOSGEB, National Agency, KÖYDES etc.), possessing educational institutions deemed successful, collecting “himmet” from people (willingly or unwillingly), and stealing examination questions in order to place their own members into state institutions.

Considering the budget of institutions like KOSGEB and TÜBİTAK (TL1 billion and TRY 2.6 billion, respectively) along with the tuition fees of FETÖ-affiliated schools that were closed down after July 15 (65,000 university students x TRY 15.000 = TRY1 billion; 140,000 private school students x TRY 15.000 = TRY 2.1 billion), it is clear that the organization generated a tremendous revenue from the education sector. In fact, FETÖ was generating TRY 8 billion in revenue from the preparatory school sector.

FETÖ has stolen test questions as a means of placing its members into crucial positions in state institutions. The questions of centralized examinations conducted by ÖSYM, like KPSS, ÖSS, ALES, Military High School, YDS, between the years 2000-2013 were stolen by the organization.

As previously mentioned, FETÖ has stolen test questions as a means of placing its members into crucial positions in state institutions. The questions of centralized examinations conducted by ÖSYM, like KPSS, ÖSS, ALES, Military High School, YDS, between the years 2000-2013 were stolen by the organization. The acquired questions were strategically employed; they were employed to abuse and exploit the state's employment policies and public expectations. For instance, while all of the ÖSS questions were shared to a limited number of extremely successful students, some of the questions were put included in tests conducted in FETÖ-affiliated preparatory schools in order to avert suspicion by causing unbalanced examination results. Moreover, students who were being educated at FETÖ-affiliated private or preparatory schools were divided into two categories in terms of sharing stolen questions: "laicists" and "non-laicists". While the FETÖ-affiliated teachers gave the slightly altered questions to the "laicists", the students said that their teachers "are experienced and are sure that similar questions will appear in the exam". Meanwhile, those deemed "non-laicists" were told that their elder brother/sister "has had a dream that revealed the exam questions".

When the organization wanted to employ their members in the state, they exaggerated certain issues, like the matter of high number of teachers waiting to be appointed by the Ministry of National Education, to an irrational extent with the help of the media, in order to create a false demand. One of the questionable examinations, the KPSS was changed to be held biannually in order to avert suspicions.

Between 2000-2016, the number of civil servants increased by 48%, which is significantly higher than the population growth rate (16%). The increase in the number of personnel was obtained in these four examinations. The entrance examinations for secondary and higher education, Turkish Armed Forces (TSK) and the Police Department are of special interest to FETÖ. In fact, 80% of the aforementioned increase in public personnel was constituted by these four examinations. As a result of statistical analyses, it was determined that FETÖ has stolen all ÖSYM examination questions, including the previously mentioned four fields, between 2000-2013.

Conducted by ÖSYM for the TSK, the specialized sergeant and military high school (ALS) entrance examination questions were stolen between 2000-2013. ALS is an examination similar to other high school entrance exams. In this respect, comparing the results of both ALS and the regular high school entrance exam reveals whether students attempted to cheat. Moreover, all students who were placed in military high schools between 2000-2007 spent their 6th grade abroad. Considering that ÖSYM held the ALS in 2000 for the first time, it is evident that all of these students were rigged to be placed in military high schools. Many candidates from certain private schools were forced to enter ALS in an organized manner and they were

successful. For instance, students from popular private schools, which are known as “secular” institutions, entered the exam and then the TSK in masses.

Police Vocational College examination questions were also stolen between 2008-2014. Similarly, regarding MEB teacher appointments, the examinations conducted in 2010 and 2012 are also a disputed matter.

Technical analyses revealed that FETÖ has also rigged 16 ALES examinations along with numerous YDS/KPDS/ÜDS examinations between 2005-2013. It is important to note that the ALES and YDS examinations are prerequisites for postgraduate studies and gaining employment in academia. Besides placing their members into universities with stolen ALES questions, FETÖ has also transferred many of its members into various state institutions. The results of the first ALES examination were never announced and were employed in different universities or departments and those who obtained a full score in the examination brought about the suspect that FETÖ has used the ALES examination as a means to recruit and place members. Moreover, FETÖ also rigged the IELTS examinations that are conducted by the British state between 2013-2014.

FETÖ rigged the IELTS examinations that are conducted by the British state between 2013-2014.

THE JUDICIAL STRUGGLE AGAINST FETÖ

Police and judiciary forces have so far been the most effective institutions in the fight against FETÖ since the organization's December 17-25 coup attempt. Even though FETÖ tried to gain a psychological advantage between the June 7th and November 1st 2015 elections, the ongoing legal processes and investigations have prevented the organization from being successful. While the coup attempt was still in progress on July 15th and the people were fighting against perpetrators of the coup, the judiciary began legal procedures against the perpetrators. There are currently, 300,000 people on trial and under investigation under the accusation of participating in the coup attempt and stealing the examination questions.

The most critical part of the legal processes against FETÖ is ascertaining whether a person is a member of the organization or not. For instance, when Germany had challenges in detecting Nazis, it implemented a report called the "Social Investigation Report". These reports included interviews with the suspect's friends conducted by sociologists and psychologists along with information about how the suspect is known at school, which team he/she supports, where he/she spends his/her time and which newspapers, books or columnist he/she reads. These reports were prepared by psychologists and sociologists, and were signed by experts. If a

person was deemed a Nazi as a result of these reports, then criminal action was taken against these individuals.

There is no similar approach in Turkish regulations; therefore, certain criteria have been determined in order to detect FETÖ members for instance:

- Using the ByLock mobile application
- Having an account at Bank Asya
- Being a member of certain unions
- Whether the person entered KPSS

This criteria should be improved and implemented into the legal regulations. In order to enact punishment, a reform in the legislation is needed. Chanting slogans and organizing demonstrations are constitutional rights; however, as was the case during the Gezi Park incidents, chanting slogans and organizing demonstrations inciting terror and chaos are considered a crime. The implementation of legal provisions to prevent these are crucial.

In addition, the legal processes concerning FETÖ members also consider the following as criteria:

1. The incidents of December 17-25, which are deemed as coup attempts, are considered a milestone. Affiliation with the organization is assessed according to actions taken after these dates.

2. Depositing more than TRY4.000 into a Bank Asya account after April 2014 and refraining from withdrawing the money for two months is considered as evidence of FETÖ affiliation. However, using credit cards issued by Bank Asya or having an individual retirement account are not considered as evidence. Nevertheless, there are only documents like photocopies of Bank Asya pass books which are not considered as evidence that provides details about one's association with Bank Asya.

3. Using the mobile application ByLock is also considered as evidence. While red and orange lists are considered as concrete evidence, blue listed individuals are considered as suspects. Moreover, if there is an affiliation between an individual's GSM number and the usage of the ByLock application, it is considered as concrete evidence of FETÖ affiliation. If the individual has used ByLock, but there is no affiliation with a GSM number, than additional evidence is sought.

4. It is being considered that FETÖ-affiliated high-level civil servants did not send their children to schools and preparatory schools belonging to the organization as a precautionary measure. Meanwhile, sending children to FETÖ schools and preparatory schools is not considered as evidence, as in some cases the children did not want to leave their school as they were in their senior year and their tuition was already paid. On the other hand, registering children in a FETÖ-affiliated schools after 2015 for the first time is considered as an evidence. Similarly,

those who continue to send their children to FETÖ-affiliated schools after 2015 without reasonable excuse (not having schools in the vicinity that are on par for example) are considered as suspects.

5. Witness and secret witness statements are also considered as evidence, while anonymous reports are not.

6. Being on the administration and supervision boards of FETÖ-affiliated associations is considered as evidence. This is true for official administrators as well as those who are officially not administrators but act like one. Being a member of these associations is not considered as concrete evidence. It is observed that while some members are passive, there are others who are not official members being active in these associations. Actively participating in the activities of these associations is considered as concrete evidence.

7. While habitual donations are considered as financing the terrorist organization, continuous and definite donations are considered as an indication of affiliation.

8. The donation ratio according to an individual's salary is also taken into consideration. For example when a person earning an average salary makes a significant donation, he/she can be considered as being affiliated with the organization. On the other hand, the individual's donations to various institutions that are not affiliated FETÖ are also taken into consideration in favor of the suspect.

9. Providing the organization with monthly "himmets" that are determined by FETÖ is considered as concrete evidence.

10. An individual's stay at FETÖ-owned houses or dormitories during their studentship years is not considered as concrete evidence. However, if the individual's actions after graduation suggest that they are affiliated with the organization, then their stay can be considered as evidence.

11. An individual's employment at FETÖ-affiliated businesses and companies is not considered a concrete evidence. However, if the individual is assigned to a certain duty by the organization, then this situation is considered as concrete evidence.

12. After FETÖ's media outlets were removed from certain platforms, members' mass cancellation of DİĞİTÜRK subscriptions is considered as evidence.

13. Staying at FETÖ-affiliated hotels for a certain event organized by FETÖ (before and after the HSYK elections) is considered as circumstantial evidence. It is assessed that non-member individuals were also invited to such events as a precaution.

14. HTS records are taken into consideration in ascertaining communications between FETÖ members.

15. Acquiring the public institution entrance examinations questions beforehand is considered as concrete evidence.

16. Finding a \$1 bill on an individual is considered circumstantial evidence.

Witness statements are not considered as concrete evidence, unless they overlap with findings. Moreover, the witness has to indicate whether they were a part of the organization; if so, they have to explain when they were a member and what their duty was in addition to proving that they know the person they are talking about.

In terms of secret witnesses, there are certain issues in practice. Those who were involved in

If there is reasonable doubt, the state should use this situation for its own advantage. In the case of suspicion, an individual should not be allowed to work at state institutions.

a crime should not be considered as a witness, secret or not. Suspects can benefit from effective remorse laws when they give up the names of their co-conspirators. This is one of the legal provisions that FETÖ abuses. In

these cases, the witnesses should also be considered as suspects. On the other hand, evidence should not be a requirement in all instances in the fight against FETÖ. If there is reasonable doubt, the state should use this situation for its own advantage. In the case of suspicion, an individual should not be allowed to work at state institutions. A large team that is tasked with investigating and supervising examinations should be formed.

■ THE POLITICAL AND ADMINISTRATIVE STRUGGLE AGAINST FETÖ

Even though it is challenging to fight against an organization which has infiltrated state institutions, formed a parallel state within the state and resorted to all means not to expose its members and achieve their ends, it is crucial for Turkey's survival as a whole. Since the organization has permeated all aspects of life and state institutions, it is not possible to eradicate FETÖ with a unidimensional fight. This struggle has political, economic, bureaucratic, legal, theological, sociological and psychological dimensions. Each of these fields is important in its own right.

As it was mentioned in the previous chapters, Gülen constantly emphasizes the “us” pronoun in order to create a new identity and uses it to play both the victim and the victor. Therefore, it should not be forgotten that the fight is against a close-knit group. Moreover, it should be taken into consideration that the organization sees non-members as “others” and that those who fight against them are deemed “enemies”. In this respect, considering their psychological status and the acts they engaged in on July 15, it can be said that the organization knows no bounds. The group psychology should be regarded while fighting against FETÖ. The fight should not be limited to political, administrative and legal dimensions, but should also include economic, social and religious dimensions.

The fight against FETÖ should remain within the legal framework. Those who are attempting to sabotage the investigations should be closely monitored. As some institutions began fighting against FETÖ later than others, they are observed to be making certain mistakes. Moreover, there are many issues in the fight against FETÖ in rural areas. These kinds of issues may harm the determination and legitimacy of the struggle. Indeed, it is observed that FETÖ's covert members are trying to intentionally sabotage investigations, aiming to weaken public support. Considering their past activities, FETÖ is known to take actions that are seemingly legal, but aren't in reality. For this reason, a consensus should be reached against organization concerning such actions.

Since FETÖ is proficient in propaganda and psychological warfare, the psychological dimension of the fight against the organization should be emphasized. It is known that FETÖ is

The fight against FETÖ should remain within the legal framework. Those who are attempting to sabotage the investigations should be closely monitored.

trying to create a perception that Turkey is ungovernable. Indeed, an arrested FETÖ member even confessed that Turkey was to go through three phases, “controlled chaos, uncontrolled chaos and international intervention”, if the coup had been successful. For this

reason, it is obvious that the organization is attempting to carry out misleading actions that are to harm Turkey economically, politically and socially. Precautions should be taken against such actions and the public should be better informed on this subject.

As FETÖ's judiciary and military coup attempts were thwarted, the organization is expected to attempt an “economic coup”. The assassination of Russian Ambassador Andrey Karlov is an indicator that FETÖ's sleeper cells will continue to attack the Turkish state. For this reason, preventing terrorist acts that nurture chaos is vital. In this respect, the media, judiciary and the security bureaucracy should be meticulously supervised. Considering that neither the international structure has supported the organization nor the FETÖ members will forsake their goals, it can be said that this fight will be prolonged and challenging. Therefore, the fight against FETÖ should be conducted with determination.

After July 15, many ministries have organized meetings and tried to develop strategies against FETÖ. Certain criteria like bank, school, association and union affiliations were determined in order to identify FETÖ members. While some have clear affiliations with the organization, others seemingly have none. The latter are named as “crypto” members. The important aspect of this fight is not to victimize those who are innocent. Another issue in this regard is the reluctance of certain bureaucrats who are thought to side with FETÖ prior to the

events of December 17-25 to improve their positions in the government. They are afraid to give the names of people whom they know are FETÖ members. This leads to the issue of safeguarding organization members.

The state should prevent its citizens from committing crimes. A state cannot wait until its citizens have committed a crime to punish them. In this respect, the organization has detected and abused certain vulnerabilities within the administration which were created by the tutelage regime. For this reason, the rehabilitation of citizens used and abused by FETÖ is important.

Meticulous attention is a must when dealing with the police department, armed forces and the judiciary. However, some statutory decrees that are published in the official gazette suggest that this is also being sabotaged. The victimization of even one individual is not tolerable for the state. People who are affiliated with the organization should be monitored in the long-term. If these people are members of the police force, armed forces or the judiciary, then more prominent precautions should be taken. On the other hand, the consensus among political parties that was established after the July 15 coup attempt is waning. Reestablishment of this consensus is crucial; if need be, a national unity commission to explain the processes to the public should be founded.

■ GENERAL ASSESSMENT AND SUGGESTIONS

FETÖ's organization and activities over the past four decades were discussed in this report in terms of the group's socio-psychological and religious understanding, while detailed opinions about FETÖ's activities in the fields of education, finance and bureaucracy are expressed. Information about what has been done and will be done in the fight against FETÖ is provided. In this respect, as a result of assessments, it is expressed that the following points should be emphasized in order to be more effective in the fight against FETÖ and to ensure the organization is completely eradicated:

1. Pooling the information that is acquired while fighting against FETÖ is vital. For this

Pooling the information that is acquired while fighting against FETÖ is vital. For this reason, a center dedicated to the coordination of this struggle should be established.

reason, a center dedicated to the coordination of this struggle should be established. Instead of dozens of institutions' individual efforts, concentrating the efforts against FETÖ under a single or-

ganization would render the process more effective. This will also allow institutions to share information with each other and to join the files. In addition, it will enable the creation of a state memory about fighting against FETÖ.

2. Another important point in the fight against FETÖ is to have a well-structured strategy which will allow to plan and coordinate efforts. Moreover, people who are determined and powerful mechanisms are required to implement this strategy.

3. It is known that there are significant irregularities in FETÖ's transfers of hidden income. The organization has used affiliated associations and foundations to transfer these funds. For this reason, associations and foundations should be supervised meticulously. The punishment for this crime is a 2-5 years prison sentence; as the punishment is currently insufficient, it should be more severe.

4. There is a need for a security force that is specialized in fighting against FETÖ. This specialized security force should be well-versed in terrorism, has to be able to think like organized crime members, be knowledgeable about financial crimes and should have its own intelligence unit.

5. MASAK's position and the reports it prepares are important in the fight against FETÖ. However, there are certain issues; MASAK's legislation should be improved and reformed. Making MASAK an independent institution is also an option. Currently, as a department within the Ministry of Finance, MASAK is unable to realize its full potential. As tax inspectors are employed at MASAK, they fall short from the expected success. MASAK's investigation criteria is inadequate in terms of capturing the essence of the issue.

6. The current status of the seized companies should be revised. The companies that could revitalize the economy should be put on sale and liquefied.

7. It is known that there are many suspects undergoing FETÖ trials. It is not possible to imprison 500,000 suspects and it is not possible to put 500,000 people on trial, most of whom are in Ankara and Istanbul. A strategy should be developed for this issue; high-level administrators of the organization should be detected and should be tried in a descending order. It is important to swiftly conclude the trials of this organization which has been infiltrating the state for four decades. Mistakes might be made; however, methods to minimize mistakes should be determined.

8. Decreasing the detention period impacts legal processes negatively. Having a prolonged detention period would facilitate legal processes. Limitations on the detention period will have a negative effect in such a situation.

9. Secret witnesses are another important issue in legal processes. It can be asserted that secret witness are a new phenomenon in the Turkish judiciary which emerged with FETÖ.

Only those who have seen the actual events or actions should be able to become secret witnesses. Otherwise, it should be avoided.

10. Individual interrogation instead of mass interrogation would lead to healthier statements, while encouraging effective remorse. Suspects should be reminded of the legal consequences of effective remorse and should be incentivized to take this route. Criteria like the change in classification of offenses, evidence, detention period, eligibility to benefit from effective remorse, suspect's position in the organization along with the suspect's health and family should be taken into consideration.

11. It is thought that judges should only approve effective remorse when they believe suspects are sincere and should order arrests if they have suspicions about sincerity. While granting effective remorse to a suspect, new, concrete information that could decipher the organization's structure should be sought. Statements that confirm facts that are already known should be disregarded.

12. Taking the European Court of Human Rights (ECHR) practices into consideration, the number of defendants and defense sessions should be limited to a reasonable period of time that is proportionate to the case and the accusations. Reforms must be implemented to achieve this. Moreover, additional reforms should be implemented to consider acquired intelligence as evidence.

13. Secret witnesses as an institution should be handled with caution. FETÖ members might attempt to manipulate the investigations. Secret witness statements should be supported with additional evidence. In fact, effective remorse should be preferred over secret witnesses, because legally secret witnesses should not have any part in the crime.

14. Besides distributing wealth and positions of power to its members and establishing a parallel state, FETÖ is also promising heaven to its members. Therefore, religious beliefs are also at play along with psychological elements. Similar to Daesh, FETÖ legitimizes all kinds of immoral and illegal actions by promising heaven to its followers. This enables FETÖ members to do what they are commanded without any question. In this respect, a great responsibility falls on the Presidency of Religious Affairs (DİB). DİB should not allow organizations like FETÖ and Daesh to spread their influence in theology. Moreover, DİB should systematically fight against the distortion of religious tenets and values, preventing religion from being utilized by terrorist organizations. These precautions will also effectively prevent religious radicalization in the future.

15. The rigid application of laicism has caused certain religious organizations to go underground. While these organizations were expected to act like NGOs, they have become something very different from NGOs. In this respect, the state should increase their supervision in these fields. If need be, Monastery and Zawiya Law should be revised. Religious organizations

should be limited to the field of religion and should not be allowed to organize within bureaucracy. Other groups that are aiming to fill the positions left by FETÖ should be prevented from doing so. The public should be informed that the fight against FETÖ is not about religion, but politics.

16. A control mechanism which is to prevent relatives of dismissed FETÖ affiliates from being radicalized should be implemented. Several public institutions should be tasked with this undertaking.

17. Another prominent point in the fight against FETÖ is to address the internal and external factors that led to the organization's emergence. Rigid laicist policies along with the state forsaking the social domain enabled FETÖ to fill certain vacancies in the society. Foreign intelligence organizations have abused these domains and utilized FETÖ against Turkey. In this respect, internal and external causes should be analyzed thoroughly.

18. It is known that external connections are vital for FETÖ. Revealing these connections would cause the organization to lose power.

MODERATORS

Yılmaz ÇOLAK	President of the Police Academy
Ufuk AYHAN	Deputy President of the Police Academy
Şafak Ertan ÇOMAKLI	Academic, Police Academy

PARTICIPANTS

Abdullah ÇAVUŞOĞLU	YÖK Member, Chairman of Havelsan
Abdullah TOLU	Certified Public Accountant, Financier
Ali Alper SAYLAN	Public Prosecutor
Cafer İŞİK	Judge, Head of the Criminal Court
Deniz TURAN	Academic, Police Academy
Feridun YILMAZ	Academic, Uludağ University
Hüseyin ARSLAN	Academic, Police Academy
Mehmet Akif KİREÇÇİ	Academic, Bilkent University
Mehmet Levent YILMAZ	Police Academy / Presidency of the Republic of Turkey
Mustafa ÖZTÜRK	Academic, Marmara University
Necip Cem İŞÇİMEN	Chief Public Prosecutor
Nusret YAZICI	Undersecretary of Ministry of Food, Agriculture and Livestock
Oğuz DİK	Judge, Head of the Criminal Court
Orçun İMGA	Academic, Police Academy
Orhan ATALAY	Member of the Parliament of Ardahan, Academic
Salih Zeki HAKLI	Academic, Police Academy
Selfet GİRAY	Judge, Head of the Criminal Court
Yasemin ABAYHAN	Academic, Hacettepe University
Yılmaz AKÇIL	Head of Justice Academy
Yusuf TEKİN	Undersecretary of Ministry of National Education
Yücel ERKMAN	Public Prosecutor